

## 5.0 CUMULATIVE IMPACTS

### 5.1 BACKGROUND

Section 15355 of the *State CEQA Guidelines* defines cumulative impacts as “two or more individual effects which, when considered together, are considerable or which compound or increase other environmental impacts.” These individual effects may entail changes resulting from a single project or from a number of separate projects. The cumulative impact from several projects is the change in the environment that results from the incremental impact of the project when added to other closely related past, present and reasonably foreseeable probable future projects. Cumulative impacts can result from individually minor but collectively significant projects occurring over a period of time.

Section 15130 of the *State CEQA Guidelines* requires that an EIR address cumulative impacts of a project when the project’s incremental effect would be cumulatively considerable. Where a lead agency determines the project’s incremental effect would not be cumulatively considerable, a brief description of the basis for such a conclusion must be included. The term “cumulatively considerable” means that the incremental effects of the individual project are considerable when viewed in connection with the effects of past projects, other current projects and the effects of probable future projects.

The cumulative analysis for the proposed former NTC landfill remediation primarily focuses on projects that would be under construction or in operation at the same time as the landfill remediation operations. Once the landfill remediation is complete, the proposed landfill remediation would generate little to no environmental effects that would have the potential to incrementally contribute to significant cumulative impacts.

### 5.2 CUMULATIVE PROJECTS

Given the anticipated geographic scope of cumulative impacts and the fact that the project is temporary and would occur over an approximately nine-month period, the cumulative analysis for the proposed project is primarily based on an analysis of projects that would be under construction or operating during that timeframe, which is anticipated to extend through the end of 2008. Known projects that could potentially contribute to cumulative impacts in association with the proposed former NTC landfill remediation are described below. The description of cumulative projects is organized by planning area and jurisdiction (e.g., City of San Diego community and precise plan areas, Port of San Diego projects, and Naval Base Point Loma).

### 5.2.1 Midway/Pacific Highway Corridor Community Plan and North Bay Plan Areas

The Midway/Pacific Highway Corridor does not border the project site, but is located along the east and northeast boundaries of SDIA. This area encompasses approximately 800 acres of relatively flat land, divided into two zones: the northern Midway area and the narrow, linear Pacific Highway Corridor. The area is currently used primarily for urbanized commercial and industrial purposes. A few multi-family residential complexes are located in the western portion of the Midway area, bordering Point Loma. Projects planned or currently underway in the Midway-Pacific Highway Corridor planning area that are expected to be under construction or operating during the term of the proposed project include the following (City of San Diego 2007e):

- *Stella* is an 87-unit condominium complex located on 0.89 acres. Stella is currently under construction and estimated for completion in 2008.
- *Aladdin Parking (at Laurel and Kettner)* would add 160,043 square feet to an existing 442,358 square-foot parking structure, adding additional 489 spaces; the construction date is unknown.

The Midway/Pacific Highway Corridor Community also is encompassed by the North Bay Redevelopment Project and Revitalization Area plan, which encompasses the entire Midway/Pacific Highway Corridor, and also extends into parts of the northeastern section of the Peninsula community planning area, and further north along I-5, including small portions of the communities of Clairemont Mesa, Linda Vista, Old Town, and Uptown. Projects slated for development in the North Bay Redevelopment Project area include the commercial development and mixed-use housing projects. The commercial development includes the SPAWAR High Technology District and the Point Loma YMCA expansion. The mixed-use housing projects include the Hancock Street, Morena Vista, and Voltaire Street Mixed-Use projects, and a Vietnam Veterans of San Diego project that will build a campus of supportive services for their clients on Pacific Highway.

### 5.2.2 Peninsula Community Plan Area

To the west of the project site is the 4,409-acre (approximately seven-square-mile) Peninsula community planning area, governed by the *Peninsula Community Plan*, as amended in September 1989. This highly urbanized community consists of 11 fairly distinct residential neighborhoods, several commercial districts, a university, three major regional recreational areas (Sunset Cliffs, Shelter Island, and Cabrillo National Monument), and the former NTC (see the discussion of NTC/Liberty Station below). Excluding Liberty Station projects (described below), three new projects within the Peninsula Community has been identified that could contribute to the cumulative effects of the proposed project:

- The *Point Loma Townhomes* is a 48-unit condominium project proposed on a 1.63-acre project site at 1275 Scott Road. Construction is expected to start in mid- to late 2008 (City of San Diego 2007e).
- *Upper Voltaire* is a 28-unit condominium and 6-commercial unit complex on a 0.97 acre site located at 4104 Voltaire Street. Construction dates are unknown.
- An unnamed 14-unit condominium complex on Voltaire Street, across from the Upper Voltaire development is also planned for development. Construction dates are unknown.

### 5.2.3 Naval Training Center/Liberty Station Precise Plan Area

To the west of the former landfill site is the rest of the NTC property, which was transferred to the City of San Diego and established as a redevelopment area in 1997. The NTC property is located within the northeast corner of the Peninsula Community. A 361-acre portion of the NTC is being developed as “Liberty Station,” under the NTC Precise Plan and Local Coastal Program, adopted in 2001. A 72-acre adjacent area remains under Navy ownership and is developed as a military family housing complex. Table 5-1 summarizes planned NTC/Liberty Station development.

One specific recent development proposal at Liberty Station is the proposed Nickelodeon/Marriott Hotel. This resort hotel will include a 650-room facility on 18 acres and will incorporate a 100,000-square-foot water park and activity deck complex featuring a variety of pools and interactive attractions. The resort is expected to begin construction in January 2008 and open in early 2010.

### 5.2.4 Uptown Community Plan

The *Uptown Community Plan* governs development in this approximately 2,700-acre area between Old Town and Balboa Park, northeast of the Downtown area, and separated from the Airport by the relatively narrow Pacific Highway Corridor. Although there are projects within the Uptown Community Plan that would be constructed or operational during the same time period in which the project is occurring, most of these projects would occur along Fifth and Sixth Avenue, and are not likely to contribute to cumulative impacts associated with the project (City of San Diego 2007f).

**Table 5-1  
NTC/Liberty Station Planned Development Program Summary**

<b>NTC Specific Planning Area</b>	<b>General Description</b>	<b>Gross Acreage</b>	<b>Total Gross Square Footage</b>	<b>New Construction</b>	<b>Rehabilitation</b>
Residential Area	Market rate single-family and multi-family homes	37	36,000 (pool/gym)	350 units	36,000 (pool/gym)
Educational Area	Focus on public and/or private education for children/adults	22	495,000	--	495,000
Office/Research & Development	Primarily traditional office uses	22	380,000	380,000 square feet	--
Mixed Use Commercial Precinct: Office, retail, live/work lofts, restaurants, commercial recreational facilities, museums	Reuse of buildings primarily within historic district	107 60	625,000 324,000	--	625,000 324,000
Civic, Arts, Culture Precinct: Civic, arts, cultural, nonprofit, office, museums, restaurants, specialty retail, special education	Reuse of buildings primarily within historic district	25	301,000	--	301,000
Golf Course Precinct	Golf Course	22	--	--	--
Park and Open Space	Public use open space and park	46 <sup>a</sup>	19,000 (child care center)	--	19,000 (child care center)
Boat Channel	Open water area for public use	54	--	To be determined	To be determined
Visitor Hotel Area	350 rooms	2 <sup>a</sup>	33,000 (conference center)	350 rooms	33,000 (conference center)
Business Hotel Area	650 rooms	16 <sup>a</sup>	--	650 rooms	--
Metropolitan Waste-water Department Area	Water-Testing Laboratory	9 <sup>a</sup>	140,000	140,000 square feet	--

Source: NTC Precise Plan and Local Coastal Program, September 2001

<sup>a</sup> This gross acreage includes the waterfront esplanade area.

### 5.2.5 Port of San Diego Master Plan

The Port of San Diego controls tidelands in the San Diego Bay area, including two planning districts in the area of the project site: the Harbor Island/Lindbergh Field planning district, and the Centre City/Embarcadero planning district. The Port District has recently approved or is considering a number of major projects, including several that would occur on San Diego Bay tidelands between downtown and Shelter Island (Port District 2007a). Potential Port District projects identified for this cumulative impacts analysis include:

- **Cruise Terminal Expansions.** The Port District is currently evaluating proposed development concepts for the Broadway Pier and B Street Cruise Terminal Pier that would

improve these facilities to serve projected growth in the San Diego cruise ship market (Port District 2007b). The improvements would be intended to meet transportation security requirements, increase terminal capacity, and improve the experience of cruise passengers, including those on transient and homeported cruise ships. Potential development concepts are undergoing evaluation and neither pier is likely to be undergoing a major upgrade concurrent with the planned former NTC landfill remediation and remediation. Renovation of Broadway Pier to strengthen its pier deck is, however, ongoing and expected to be completed in 2008 (Port District 2007c, d).

- **Lane Field Redevelopment.** This proposed redevelopment project, named for the former athletic field located near B Street and Harbor Drive, includes two elements, Lane Field North and Lane Field South. The Port District Board has approved the development of a 500 to 550 room hotel on Lane Field South and a 250 to 300 room hotel on Lane Field North. These projects are currently undergoing review to determine if any additional environmental analysis is required under CEQA, or if the projects are adequately addressed under the Port Master Plan and its associated EIR (Port District 2007a).
- **West Island Palms West Hotel.** The Port District approved the Island Palms West Hotel project in October 2006. The proposed Island Palms West Hotel Project, which would be located on Shelter Island, includes demolition and removal of the former Voyager Restaurant building of approximately 11,627 square feet; construction of a new three-story hotel building of approximately 25,600 square feet that includes 48 guest rooms plus marina offices and facilities; remodeling of the existing building to provide 77 guestrooms, an approximately 1,560-square foot two-story main lobby, and an approximately 1,330-square foot dining area; and other related elements (Port District 2006).
- **Hilton San Diego Convention Center Hotel.** This hotel project, located adjacent to the San Diego Convention Center, includes a 385 foot tower, 106,000 square feet of meeting space, 5,360 square feet of retail space, a 23,082 square-foot health club, 1,200 private rooms, a 14,000 square-foot restaurant, and a 4.3-acre public park (Port District 2007a). This project is currently under construction, with completion targeted for December 2008 (Hensel Phelps Construction 2007).
- **Redevelopment of Old Police Headquarters and Harbor Seafood Mart.** The planned redevelopment of the old police headquarters site includes retention and adaptive reuse of the old police headquarters for a mix of specialty retail, entertainment and restaurant uses; demolition of Harbor Seafood Mart and development of a smaller facility to incorporate commercial fishing uses, a waterfront fish restaurant and retail spaces; reconfiguration of parking lots; and new public park and plaza areas. Construction is expected to be complete in 2008 (Port District 2007a).

- **East Harbor Island Redevelopment.** The Port District is evaluating redevelopment of approximately 17.8 acres of east Harbor Island with a 600-room hotel, over 21,000 square feet of meeting space, restaurants, retail, public plazas and promenades and associated public infrastructure. The proposed site includes approximately 2.10 acres of water area and 15.70 acres of land area currently developed with two restaurants (one of which would be incorporated as part of the project), a 600-slip marina (which would remain, albeit with new marina buildings and other improvements), and a surface parking lot for airport employees.
- **Woodfin Suites Hotel Project.** The proposed Woodfin Suites Hotel Project involves the demolition of all existing structures on the 3.79-acre filled tidelands portion of the project site on West Harbor Island, and the construction and operation of a 165,000-foot structure, to include an eight-story (maximum 140-suite) hotel, and a 12,500-square-foot clubhouse (including spa and restaurant). In addition, 401 parking spaces would be provided (including 59 underground spaces within the hotel structure), as well as a two-story, approximately 11,200-square-foot marina services building, and an approximately 1,120-linear-foot seawall topped by a public promenade, along the northern limit of tidelands within the property. The Final EIR for the Woodfin Project was approved in July 2006.

#### 5.2.6 Naval Base Point Loma

Naval Base Point Loma consists of nine separate Navy complexes that provide shore installation support to more than 64 tenant commands with 22,000 military and civilian personnel and more than 450 unique facilities (U.S. Navy 2007). One proposed new project was identified at Naval Base Point Loma that could contribute to the cumulative effects of the proposed former NTC landfill remediation, a fuel storage tank replacement project proposed for a location on Rosecrans Street south of North Harbor Drive (U.S. Navy 2006).

#### 5.2.7 Marine Corps Recruit Depot San Diego

The June 2007 MCRD Final Report Master Plan Update identifies a number of planned improvements at MCRD. Given the above-described timeframes associated with the proposed former NTC landfill remediation project, the assessment of potential cumulative projects associated with MCRD focuses on those actions identified as “Near-term Projects CIP-1” in the MCRD Final Report Master Plan Update Capital Improvements Program (CIP). The CIP identifies 23 near-term projects, including fence improvements along Pacific Highway, a parking lot expansion, 2 projects to improve the Gate 5 area and associated pass and ID facilities, 17 existing building renovation/repair/improvement projects, and two new buildings. The two new buildings are identified as an approximately 33,000-square foot logistics support warehouse to be built in fiscal year 2009 and an approximately 53,000-square foot recruit support barracks to be built in fiscal year 2010. The U.S. Marine Corps’ fiscal year extends from October 1 through September 30 (for example, fiscal year 2009 will run from October 1, 2008

through September 30, 2009).; accordingly, it is possible that fiscal year 2009 construction of the logistics support warehouse could overlap with former NTC landfill remediation activities occurring during calendar year 2008. Former NTC landfill remediation activities should be complete before construction begins on the new approximately 53,000-square foot recruit support barracks.

### 5.3 CUMULATIVE IMPACT ANALYSIS BY ISSUE AREA

#### 5.3.1 Transportation/Circulation

The evaluation of traffic and circulation impacts in Section 4.1 of this EIR includes analysis of traffic volumes expected to be generated by other projects. The approach to addressing future traffic volumes included (1) incorporating traffic from specific projects that would be likely to contribute trips to the same roads as the former NTC landfill remediation (i.e., the proposed Nickelodeon/Marriott hotel and the fuel farm improvement) and (2) adding a one percent annual increase over existing traffic levels to incorporate other potential projects that may not be included in the regional traffic model used to assess potential traffic and circulation impacts. As described in Section 4.1, the results of that analysis indicated that the proposed project would not contribute to a significant cumulative traffic or circulation impact.

#### 5.3.2 Hazards and Toxic/Hazardous Materials

The potential hazards and toxic/hazardous materials effects of the proposed project would be limited to the immediate former landfill site vicinity, thereby limiting the potential for the proposed project to incrementally contribute to hazards or toxic/hazardous materials effects of other projects. Additionally, with the potential exception of the fuel farm replacement project, whose effects would also be extremely localized, none of the other projects is expected to generate substantive quantities of potentially hazardous materials. Accordingly, the proposed former NTC landfill remediation is not expected to incrementally contribute to a significant cumulative hazards or toxic/hazardous materials impact.

#### 5.3.3 Air Quality/Odors

The air quality emissions associated with the proposed former NTC landfill remediation would be temporary (lasting less than one year). Based on their short-term nature, the potential for impacts to contribute to a significant cumulative air quality impact is limited. As described in Section 4.3, the proposed project would exceed NO<sub>x</sub> emissions thresholds and, as a result, be considered significant at a project level. These short-term emissions would not, however, contribute to long-term air quality degradation or affect the ability of the San Diego Air Basin to achieve attainment with long-term state

and federal air quality standards. Accordingly, the proposed project would not incrementally contribute to a significant cumulative air quality impact.

#### 5.3.4 Water Quality

The proposed project would have the potential to affect water quality primarily through the extraction and disposal of groundwater. As described in Section 4.4, extracted groundwater would be treated on-site as necessary to achieve compliance with MWWD requirements for disposal of extracted groundwater to the sewer system. The MWWD's discharge requirements have been established to ensure that the combined discharges of extracted groundwater to the sewer system do not (1) degrade the ability of the PLWTP to treat wastewater flows, and/or (2) affect the ability of the MWWD to meet applicable water quality standards at the PLWTP's point of discharge off Point Loma. Based on the project design measure described in Chapter 2.0, and based on the analysis presented in Section 4.4, no contaminated groundwater is expected to migrate off the project site. Accordingly, the proposed project would not incrementally contribute to significant cumulative water quality impacts.

#### 5.3.5 Aesthetics/Visual Resources

Given the limited number of publicly accessible locations with views to the project site, the relatively low sensitivity of most potential viewers to changes in the visual environment, and the temporary nature of project effects, the proposed landfill remediation would not incrementally contribute to a significant cumulative visual impact.

#### 5.3.6 Noise

The proposed project would be located within the relatively noisy environment of an active commercial airport. As described in Section 4.6, it would be difficult to perceive project-related noise in comparison to ambient (background) noises at the closest sensitive receptors—the residences located over 2,000 feet west of the project site and the MCRD barracks to the north. With the exception of other Liberty Station development and MCRD near-term CIP projects, none of the cumulative projects identified above would be expected to be audible by these receptors. Given the short-term nature of project construction, the absence of long-term noise sources associated with a closed landfill, and the distance between the proposed project and sensitive noise receptors, the project would not be expected to incrementally contribute to a significant cumulative noise impact.

#### 5.3.7 Public Services

The proposed project could affect sewer and wastewater treatment capacity, and it would contribute waste to regional and out-of-state landfills. As described in Section 4.7, the sewer system and the

PLWTP have adequate capacity to handle proposed project discharges of extracted groundwater. Given the short-term nature of these discharges and the substantial excess capacity in the system, the proposed project would not incrementally contribute to a significant cumulative impact to the sewer system.

With regard to landfills, the proposed project would generate up to approximately 175,000 cy of waste for disposal at local, central California and out-of-state landfills. The disposal of this waste would incrementally contribute to the point at which these landfills reach their respective capacities and can no longer accept new waste. As landfills reach capacity, however, they can be expanded, or waste can be hauled to new locations. As noted in Section 2.3.1, two of the three local landfills (Miramar and Sycamore Canyon) are currently undergoing review for expansion. The Clean Harbors facility in Kern County has an anticipated closure of date of 2040, and the Copper Mountain facility in Arizona is expected to have sufficient capacity for an additional century. It is reasonable to expect that, as these landfills reach their capacities, they would either be expanded or alternatives would be available to accept waste. In addition, waste reduction requirements, such as the current requirements that local governments divert 50 percent of their waste streams away from landfills, are likely to become more stringent in the future if a shortage of landfill capacity becomes an increasingly pressing issue. Based on these factors, the proposed project is not expected to incrementally contribute to a significant impact to landfill capacity.

#### 5.3.8 Biological Resources

As described in Section 4.8, the proposed project would not affect biologically sensitive habitat or wildlife species. The project site is surrounded by urban development and is part of an active, commercial airport. Development of the site would not contribute to fragmentation of habitat or contribute to edge effects on nearby sensitive biological resources. Additionally, the proposed project would be in compliance with the USFWS biological opinion for California least terns at SDIA, including those measures specific to construction. Based on these factors, the proposed project would not incrementally contribute to a significant biological resources impact.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK